

Report: Draft Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan for July 12, 2018
Attachment B: June 21, 2018 Task Force Meeting Synopsis

Port of Oakland
“Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan”
Task Force Meeting

Thursday, June 21, 2018
2:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.
Waterfront Hotel – Spinnaker I Room
10 Washington St., Jack London Square, Oakland

Meeting Synopsis

Note: This Meeting Synopsis presents a general summary of the *Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan* Task Force Meeting held on June 21, 2018 and is intended to provide the Board and the public with a general description of that meeting. This Meeting Synopsis is an attachment to the June 29, 2018, Information Report (Report) describing the *Draft Port of Oakland Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan*, which the Port intends to post on its public website on Friday, June 29, 2018. The Port intends to prepare a more detailed Meeting Summary of the June 21, 2018, Task Force Meeting in late June 2018-early July 2018. When finalized, the Port will post the detailed Meeting Summary on its public website.

Introduction and Background

Co-Chairs:

Andy Garcia, Chairman of the Board, GSC Logistics, represents Industry
Ms. Margaret Gordon, Co-chairperson of the West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP), represents Community / Environmental Justice
John Driscoll, Director of Maritime, Port of Oakland – alternate for Chris Lytle, represents Port of Oakland
Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer for Policy of the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) – alternate for Jack Broadbent, represents BAAQMD

Meeting objectives:

- Receive updates on Port of Oakland’s transition from *Maritime Air Quality Improvement Plan (MAQIP)* Planning to *Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan (“2020 and Beyond Plan.”)*
- Provide input regarding the public engagement process for the *2020 and Beyond Plan*.
- Hear information regarding policies behind the State of California “zero-emissions” goals.
- Share and participate in discussions regarding specific industry strategies and stakeholder interests as we all collaboratively move forward on a pathway to zero emissions.

During the opening statements from the Co-Chairs, the Co-Chairs acknowledged that the meeting provided an opportunity to collectively look at the problem of air quality. It was acknowledged that the Port desires to remain financially sustainable and to grow; working

Report: Draft Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan for July 12, 2018
Attachment B: June 21, 2018 Task Force Meeting Synopsis

together, everyone can help to identify ways to do so given current business and environmental conditions.

Because the agenda for the meeting was shared in advance (copy included below), many in attendance were aware that the focus of the meeting would be “the pathway to zero emissions” as the Vision for the *2020 and Beyond Plan*. Attendees included approximately 25 people representing diverse interests and stakeholder groups in addition to Port staff. The list of attendees and participants is provided below.

The meeting included a presentation from Cynthia Marvin (CM), Division Chief of the Transportation and Toxics Division at the California Air Resources Board (CARB) on the move from “near zero-emissions” to “zero emissions.” Ms. Marvin emphasized the change in technology and regulations and requirements over the years that support this shift. Ms. Marvin discussed the intersection of community engagement with the process, the implications of Assembly Bill 617, and incentives that would help to move everyone forward.

Following Ms. Marvin’s presentation, each of the Co-Chairs shared remarks regarding how the move to “zero emissions” would impact their constituencies, sectors and other concerns. John Driscoll, Port Maritime Director, elaborated on the Port’s position in context with the change from “near-zero” to “zero emissions.”

Richard Sinkoff, Director of Environmental Programs and Planning, Port of Oakland, brought everyone up-to-date with a presentation on the development of the *Draft 2020 and Beyond Plan*, the successor plan to the *MAQIP*. Mr. Sinkoff explained that the *2020 and Beyond Plan* moves the Port forward in the direction of zero emissions. Mr. Sinkoff reviewed six key policy issues that frame the *Draft Plan* and answered questions from those in the audience about the *Draft Plan*.

I. GENERAL RESPONSE

Generally, there was a general positive tone for the meeting. The Port had indicated support of a pathway to a zero-emissions Seaport. This was a new stance for the Port and well-received.

The following are *a few* of the key points for further discussion:

- The duration of time to get to zero emissions and what technology and infrastructure are available now versus what may be coming on-line in the near future is a paramount concern for all.
- There are concerns about whether there is sufficient infrastructure at the Port to support any new technology or provide a grid for fully zero-emissions operations. There is an expectation of a Port infrastructure study or inventory to begin within the next year.
- From industry, the Port, and other sectors, there are concerns regarding the potential loss of jobs if a zero-emissions Seaport were to create the potential for

Report: Draft Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan for July 12, 2018
Attachment B: June 21, 2018 Task Force Meeting Synopsis

automation as well as concerns regarding training for future operations and jobs at the Port.

- Some in attendance questioned the number of opportunities to review the *Draft Plan*. There was a shared expression from a few community members that three meetings, including the June 21, 2018, Task Force meeting, are not enough. There is concern about how the planning and development of *2020 and Beyond Plan* overlaps with the requirements of AB 617. A suggestion was made to look at both activities and see where there may be overlaps. One attendee stated that AB 617 had some community-specific outcomes in July 2018 that may impact the Port of Oakland and its work with the larger West Oakland community.

II. Conclusion

The meeting closed with clear expectations that Task Force members would review the *Draft 2020 and Beyond Plan* upon its posting on the Port's website on June 29, 2018, followed by a public review and comment period. Following the public review and comment period, the Port is planning *Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond* Task Force meetings in September and October or early November 2018.

Attendees

2018 MAQIP Update Task Force Co-Chairs and Alternates in Attendance:

Margaret Gordon, Co-Chair, West Oakland Environmental Indicators Project (WOEIP)
Andy Garcia, Chairman of the Board, GSC Logistics
John Driscoll, Maritime Director, Port of Oakland
Greg Nudd, Deputy Air Pollution Control Officer for Policy, Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD)
Brian Beveridge, Co-Chair, WOEIP (last half of meeting)

2018 MAQIP Update Task Force Members and Alternates in Attendance:

Bill Aboudi, AB Trucking
Dave O'Neal, TraPac, Inc.
Roman Berenshteyn, Bay Planning Coalition
Doug Bloch, Teamsters Joint Council 7 SF Bay Area
Bryan Brandes, CMA-CGM
Tracy Cheung, Pacific Gas and Electric (PG&E)
Anna Lee, Alameda County Public Health Dept.
Richard Grow, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Xavier Johnson, Office of Congresswoman Barbara Lee
Matt Nichols, Office of Oakland City Mayor Libby Schaaf
Paul Konzen (Member) and Joey Martins (Alternate) CVAG
Ken Larson, SSA Terminals
John McLaurin, Pacific Merchant Shipping Association (PMSA)
Amy Shrago, Office of Supervisor Keith Carson

Port of Oakland Staff in Attendance:

Richard Sinkoff, Director of Environmental Programs and Planning
Diane Heinze, Port Environmental Supervisor
Catherine Mukai, Port Associate Environmental Planner/Scientist
Amy Tharpe, Director of the Social Responsibility
Laura Arreola, Community Relations
Julina Bonilla, Workforce Development Manager
Matt Davis, Director of Governmental Affairs
Basil Wong, Manager of Utilities Administration
Tim Leong, Maritime Project Administrator
Luana Espana, Port Assistant Management Analyst
Khamly Chuop, Port Associate Environmental Planner/Scientist
Andrea Gardner, Port Associate Environmental Planner/Scientist
Diana Servin Ayala, Port Intern
Breanna Madison, Port Intern
Antoneil Carter, Port Intern
Sara Hakala, Port Intern
Alex Pineda, Port Intern

Members of the Facilitation Team in Attendance:

Surlene Grant, Principal, Envirocom Communications Services
Malka Kopell, Principal, Malka R. Kopell Consulting

Report: Draft Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan for July 12, 2018
Attachment B: June 21, 2018 Task Force Meeting Synopsis

Members of the Public in Attendance (including presenters and staff of Task Force member organizations):

Milt Merritt, American Maritime Navigation Services (AMNAV)
Cynthia Marvin, California Air Resources Control Board (CARB; presenter)
David Quiros, CARB
Chris Shimoda, California Trucking
Peter Okurowski, CEA Consulting
Michael Murphy, BAAQMD
Will Quinn, PG&E
Susanne von Rosenberg, GAIA Consulting, Inc. (Consultant to the Port of Oakland)
Andy Katz, Sierra Club
Elizabeth Yura, BAAQMD

Port of Oakland
“Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan”
June 21, 2018

2:00 p.m. – 5:00 p.m.

Waterfront Hotel – Spinnaker I Room
 10 Washington St., Jack London Square, Oakland

Agenda

The meeting will start promptly at 2 p.m. Please plan to arrive by 1:45 p.m. We have a full agenda and want to ensure that everyone is seated and prepared to begin at 2 p.m. Refreshments will be served. *Thank you for your consideration.*

Meeting Objectives:

- Receive updates on Port of Oakland’s transition from MAQIP Planning to Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan.
- Provide input regarding the public engagement process for the 2020 and Beyond Plan.
- Hear information regarding policies behind the State of California “zero-emissions” goals.
- Share and participate in discussions regarding specific industry strategies and stakeholder interests as we all collaboratively move forward on a pathway to zero emissions.

Topic and Presenter		Time
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND		2-2:20p.m
I.	Call to Order and Introductions Agenda Review Welcome	15 mins
	Surlene Grant, Facilitator Committee Co-Chairs	
II.	Meeting Purpose and Framework <i>“Changing Times and the Pathway to Zero Emissions”</i>	5 mins
	John Driscoll, Maritime Director, Port of Oakland	
GUIDING PRINCIPLE – LEARNING TOGETHER		2:20-3 p.m.
III.	<i>“Zero Emissions” – More than Just “Zero or Nothing”</i>	15 min
	Cynthia Marvin, Division Chief, Transportation and Toxics, California Air Resources Board	
IV.	Seaport Air Quality Co-Chairs <i>“Zero Emissions” – More Than Just “Zero or Nothing”</i>	10 min
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Port – John Driscoll • Industry – Andy Garcia • Community Focus – Margaret Gordon • BAAQMD – Greg Nudd 	
V.	Question-and-Answer Period	15 mins
	ALL - Surlene Grant	

Report: Draft Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan for July 12, 2018
Attachment B: June 21, 2018 Task Force Meeting Synopsis

CURRENT PLANNING – UPDATE and SOLICITING INPUT			3 – 3:30 pm
VI.	Overview and Update of Seaport Air Quality 2020 and Beyond Plan	Richard Sinkoff, Environmental Planning and Programs Director, Port of Oakland	15 min
VII.	Public Engagement and the Role and Responsibility of Task Force in the Process	Co-Chair Andy Garcia Amy Tharpe, Director of Social Responsibility, Port of Oakland	5 min
VIII.	Questions and Answers	All - Surlene Grant	10 mins
GUIDING PRINCIPLE – INFORMATION SHARING			3:30 -5 p.m.
IX.	Port Planning and Zero Emissions and Your Interests Group instructions for Dialogue segment <i>(Also short meeting break to view equipment)</i>	Surlene Grant, Facilitator	10 mins
X.	Dialogue and Discussion	Facilitators and All	1 hour
XI.	Report Out / Sharing Themes and Recommendations	Surlene Grant and All	10 mis
XII.	Closing Remarks Next steps	Surlene Grant, Co-Chairs	10 mins

Meeting Information: To minimize printing, a limited number of presentation handouts will be provided at the meeting. All presentations will be available on the Port of Oakland’s Air Quality website at:

<https://www.portofoakland.com/community/environmentalstewardship/maritime-air-quality-improvement-plan/>

Guiding Principles: Guiding principles are the values which apply throughout the planning process, including plan development, public participation and implementation. These are proposed guiding principles:

- Planning is a joint fact-finding and co-learning process
- All stakeholders share the desire to develop knowledge and capacity to promote informed decision-making
- The pursuit of near-term “wins” adds value to long-term planning
- Pragmatic and practical solutions advance Plan progress
- Strong partnerships are a critical element of Plan implementation

Rules of Engagement:

- Use conversational courtesy.
 - “I agree to listen to you, and you in turn agree to listen to me.”
- Be respectful of differences. Disagreements are okay, personal attacks are not.
- Every conversation in the room will be to the topic at hand.
 - Cell phone conversations and visiting will be done away from meeting room